Inclusive Leadership
May 21, 2023
Facilitators:
  Odi Ehie, MD (she, her, hers)
  Pramita Kuruvilla, MD (she, her, hers)

Faculty Developer Team: Jyothi Marbin MD, Sandrijn van Schaik MD PhD, Odi Ehie MD, Kewchang Lee MD, and Pramita Kuruvilla MD

Teach for UCSF Education Leadership Certificate Series
Land Acknowledgement

We would like to acknowledge the Ramaytush Ohlone people, who are the traditional custodians of this land. We pay our respects to the Ramaytush Ohlone elders, past, present, and future, who call this place, the land that UCSF sits upon, their home. We are proud to continue their tradition of coming together and growing as a community. We thank the Ramaytush Ohlone community for their stewardship and support, and we look forward to strengthening our ties as we continue our relationship of mutual respect and understanding.
Introductions

• In chat, please share your department, leadership role, and your favorite food.
Creative Commons License

Attribution-NonCommercial-Share Alike 4.0 Unported

You are free:
• to Share — to copy, distribute and transmit the work
• to Remix — to adapt the work

Under the following conditions:
• Attribution. You must give the original authors credit (but not in any way that suggests that they endorse you or your use of the work).
• Noncommercial. You may not use this work for commercial purposes.
• Share Alike. If you alter, transform, or build upon this work, you may distribute the resulting work only under a license identical to this one.

See http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/4.0/ for full license.
Zoom Etiquette

- Mute yourself please!
- Camera on if possible, especially during small group breakouts
- Questions in chat box, or raise hand (function next to your name on zoom)
- Aim to break once per hour
Disclosure

No one involved in the planning or presentation of this activity has any relevant financial relationships with a commercial interest to disclose.
Disclosure

This talk MAY be uncomfortable...
Objectives:

- Recognize the barriers faced by people from minoritized groups in achieving leadership positions
- Identify unconscious biases and manage them in self and others
- Recognize and respond to microaggressions toward community members from minoritized groups in order to promote an inclusive work and learning environment
- Develop strategies for allyship to promote inclusive leadership
Agenda

- Orientation
- Framing the problem: what gets in the way?
- Structural bias and interpersonal bias
- Be an inclusive leader: practice and reflect
- Create a plan for the future
- Wrap-up and evaluation
Guidelines for Discussion

Enter in to the chat box, or unmute yourself to share!
What does Inclusive Leadership Mean to you?

- Small groups – introduce yourselves
- Please share: what does inclusive leadership mean to you?
Framing the Problem
What’s the Problem?

I will remember that I remain a member of society, with special obligations to ALL my fellow human beings.

https://www.aamc.org/data-reports/data
Percentage of Full-Time U.S. Medical School Faculty by Gender, 2009-2018

https://www.aamc.org/data-reports/data
Administrative Faculty Leaders by Gender, 2018

**Figure 24**

Senior Associate/ Vice Dean
- **Women**: 265
- **Men**: 516
- **Women 2013-2014**: 33%
- **Women 2008-2009**: 36%
- **Women 2003-2004**: 24%

Associate Dean
- **Women**: 331
- **Men**: 370
- **Women 2013-2014**: 39%
- **Women 2008-2009**: 35%
- **Women 2003-2004**: 30%

Assistant Dean
- **Women**: 248
- **Men**: 228
- **Women 2013-2014**: 46%
- **Women 2008-2009**: 48%
- **Women 2003-2004**: 47%

https://www.aamc.org/data-reports/data
Percentage of Medical School Deans by Gender, 2009-2018

https://www.aamc.org/data-reports/data

Since 2009, the number of women deans increased by about one each year, on average.
Black or African American applicants have lower medical school acceptance rates than peer applicants.

- White: 44%
- Asian: 42%
- Hispanic or Latino: 42%
- Black or African American: 34%
Teherani et al. Acad Med 2018

Figure 1 Fishbone diagram illustrating the causes, effects, and consequences of lower assessed performance in underrepresented in medicine (UIM) students compared with all students.
Why does this matter?
Definitions: Diversity, Equity and Inclusion
Diversity – 3 constructs

1. **Diversity as variety**: differences in information, knowledge or experience among members of an organization or group
   - *Positively impacts creativity, learning and decision making*

2. **Diversity as separation**: differences in position or opinion among members
   - *In-group vs out-group thinking can lead to conflict, discrimination, poor teamwork, and hamper inclusivity (sense of “fit”)*

3. **Diversity as disparity**: differences in status between members
   - *Can lead to power differentials and hierarchical structures that limit inclusion and diversity as variety*
Inclusive leaders:

Promote diversity as variety, and work to diminish diversity as separation and disparity
Inclusive Leadership – small group

- Take a few minutes to consider an example where you thought leadership (by you or someone else) failed to optimize diversity, equity and/or inclusion

- Small Group Discussion (10 minutes)
  - What was the problem?
  - Did you respond, and if so, how?
  - What (could have) made a difference in this situation?
  - Was the leader a prototypical leader for the group, and if so, did that play a role?
BREAK
Social Identity Theory of Leadership

- Leadership is a group process generated by social categorization and prototype-based depersonalization processes associated with social identity.
- Prototypical leaders are recognized by the group as representative and supportive of the shared social identity.
- This empowers people with prototypical leadership characteristics to take on, and stay in, leadership roles.
- Helps explain why it has been challenging to break the traditional (white) male dominance in leadership roles.
INDIVIDUAL

A person’s beliefs & actions that serve to perpetuate oppression
- conscious and unconscious
- externalized and internalized

INTERPERSONAL

The interactions between people — both within and across difference

INSTITUTIONAL

Policies and practices at the organization (or “sector”) level that perpetuate oppression

STRUCTURAL

How these effects interact and accumulate across institutions — and across history

https://nationalequityproject.org/resources/featured-resources/lens-of-systemic-oppression
Implicit Bias

Structural Racism

- Voting rights
- FHA Loans
- Residential segregation
- Access to education, green space, resources, safety, healthcare, etc
- Jobs, hiring, & advancement

www.nationalequityproject.org
Icons adapted from the Noun Project
Systems Bias

- Structural disadvantage of one social group compared to other group

- Inherent tendency of a process to support particular outcomes regardless of intention
Biased systems CREATE and SECURE inequality
Intention v. Impact

**Intention:** What I meant to do

**Impact:** What I actually did

Focus on intention is an act of privilege
Implications of Structural Bias in the Clinical Environment

- Affects who is in the learning environment
  - Learners
  - Teachers
  - Decision makers

- Affects patient health outcomes
Racial Disparities in Medical Student Membership in the Alpha Omega Alpha Honor Society

Dowin Boatright, MD, MBA; David Ross, MD, PhD; Patrick O’Connor, MD, MPH; Edward Moore, PhD; Marcella Nunez-Smith, MD, MHS
Structural racism leads to health disparities

- Systematic disinvestment --> under-resourced health care facilities in BIPOC neighborhoods affect access and utilization
- Exposure to environmental toxins
- Poor housing quality
- Better HOLC neighborhood grades are associated with lower levels of airborne carcinogens and higher levels of tree-canopy coverage
- Predominantly white neighborhoods generally have lower air-pollution levels
- Carceral and police systems maintain racial hierarchy, break up families, and kill BIPOC people

In-Group Preferences
In-Group Preferences

Does source matter? Nurses' and Physicians' perceptions of interprofessional feedback

Sandrijn M van Schaik, Patricia S O'Sullivan, Kevin W Eva, David M Irby, Glenn Regehr


A Vicious Cycle of Bias: Residents' Perceptions of Leadership in Health Care

Ju, Mindy MD, MA; van Schaik, Sandrijn M. MD, PhD

Author Information ©

Academic Medicine: November 2021 - Volume 96 - Issue 115 - p 5103-5108
Stereotype Threat
The center of the wheel represents characteristics that are usually most permanent or visible.

The outside of the wheel represents dimensions that are acquired and change over the course of a lifetime.

The combinations of all these dimensions influence our values, beliefs, behaviors, experiences and expectations and make us all unique as individuals.

*Johns Hopkins University*
Privilege operates on a systems level and an individual level

▪ What is privilege?
  • Unearned social advantages, benefits, or respect that an individual has by virtue of belonging to certain social groups
  • Can’t be taken or given; is granted by social identity

▪ Self reflection (3 minutes):
  • What privileges do you benefit from?
  • Can you think of a time you used your privilege to help someone else at work?
Privilege Wheel

Privilege / Society normatives
- Non-disabled
- Mental good health
- Wealth / financial stability
- Heterosexual
- Heteronormativity
- Eurocentrism
- European heritage
- White
- Male
- Male and masculine
- Female and feminine
- Genderism
- Sexism / Androcentrism
- Racism
- Religious
- Infertile
- Jews
- Dark skinned
- English as additional language
- Working Class
- Unattractive
- Old
- Non-literate
- Disabled people
- Mentally ill people
- LGBTQ+
- Poor / financially insecure people
- Non-European origin
- Black Minority Ethnic people
- Gender "deviance"
- Female
- Fertile
- Anti-semitism
- Pro-natalism
- Anglophones
- Light, pale skinned
- Gentile
- Non-Jew
- Upper and Upper-Middle Class
- Classism
- Upper
- Attractive
- Educationalism
- Politics of appearance
- Disability
- Credentialed
- Ageism
- Young
- Wealth

Oppression/Resistance

Domination

OE
Taking Ownership
Reflection Exercise/Break: 15 minutes

How might you be contributing to the problem or helping to maintain the status quo?

Take a break, then return and silently reflect on this question.
Putting it into practice

- Focus on microaggressions
Strategies for Disrupting Microaggressions:
Microaggressions: What gets in the way…

- There are many reasons why it is difficult to respond to microaggressions
  - Power differentials among those involved
  - Individual (interpersonal) communication styles
  - The need to process/digest the interaction etc.
  - Emotional Activation (Fight or Flight)
  - Perceived or experienced consequences
  - Processing the Interaction (it takes time)

- In the spirit of Allyship, it is important to disrupt the expectation that targets of microaggressions are solely responsible to address them.
Microaggressions & Allyship

- Allyship is an active, consistent, and ongoing practice of unlearning and re-evaluating, in which a person in a position of privilege and power intentionally operates in solidarity with a targeted group. Practicing Allyship is not linear or constant and requires ongoing self-reflection and learning.

- **Allyship Action Continuum** (Griffin and Harro, 2006)
  - Actively Participating in Harm/Oppression
  - Denying / Ignoring
  - Recognizing, No Action
  - Recognizing, Action
  - Educating Self
  - Educating Others
  - Supporting / Encouraging
  - Initiating / Preventing
Indirect Strategies for Addressing Microaggressions

- Ignore/Do Nothing (for the target): Depending on the circumstances removing one’s self from a situation may be an appropriate strategy.

- Redirect: Change the subject

- Uplift: Elevate the target “You were partnered with an amazing provider and you are so fortunate to have them taking care of you.”

- “Besting”: Using data and information to debunk myth/stereotype
Direct Strategies for Addressing Microaggressions

- **Checking In:** Schedule/find time to check in, even if the moment has passed. This can be for the actor and/or the target. (“I’ve been reflecting on something that occurred the other day and wanted to know if you have a few minutes to check in?”)

- **Clarify:** Ask for clarification on the statement (“What do you mean by ___?” “Can you elaborate on what you meant by ___?”)

- **Raise Awareness:** Inform the actor of the potential microaggression you observed (“During the meeting I heard you use the term ___ when referring to ___. I am not sure if you are aware…”)

- **Communicate Impact:** Inform the actor of the impact of their statement (“When you said ___ it made me feel ___.”; “I’m feeling uncomfortable by your language.”)

- **Disrupt:** Establish a clear boundary “We don’t tolerate derogatory language in our hospital. We ask that everyone speak respectfully.”
Case discussions

- Small group in break-out rooms
- 10 minute per case
- Case materials and discussion questions on wiki
- 5 min large group debrief
Case Scenario 1: Interpersonal Example

- A week after the protests started following George Floyd’s death, a critical care fellow who is a Black male starts his shift by meeting a patient in the cardiac intensive care. He introduces himself, and the patient (a middle-aged white male) says “I am surprised you are here, shouldn’t you be out there rioting with your people?” The fellow responds: “I’m sorry, what did you say?” The patient repeats: “Shouldn’t you be out there rioting with your people?”

- The fellow then excuses himself and leaves the room to find a private space.

- A few bystanders heard the interaction, but nothing was said.
Case 1 Discussion Questions

a) If you had been present with the patient and the fellow, how would/could have you responded?

b) If you heard about this interaction from the fellow after it happened, what would/could have been your response?
Case Scenario 2: Structural Example

❖ Your Chair has appointed you to be the Chair of a search committee for a new Vice Chair for Academic Affairs for your department. Your committee is meeting for the first time to review the applications and select candidates for interviews.

❖ You have received 12 applications from a diverse group of departmental faculty, and after discussion, you ask the committee to vote for their top 4 candidates to invite for an interview. The 3 candidates with the most votes are all White men. Your Vice Chair for DEI, who sits on the committee, raises this point.
Case 2 discussion questions

a) What are possible reasons for your committee to find itself in this situation?

b) What considerations would you discuss with the committee about moving into the interview phase?

c) What recommendations would you make to the Chair regarding any structural issues that this situation raises?
Moving Forward
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Diversity construct</th>
<th>Example interventions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Promote diversity as variety</strong></td>
<td>• Encourage/require diverse representation in committees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(differences in information, knowledge or experience among members of an organization or group)</td>
<td>• Promote team approach in everyday work (e.g. rounds, huddles etc)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Invite underrepresented groups or group members to speak/participate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Decrease diversity as separation</strong></td>
<td>• Bias training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(differences in position or opinion among members, in-group vs out-group formation and stereotyping)</td>
<td>• Create policies around bias, microaggressions and in-group preferences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Highlight examples that break through stereotypes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Counter microaggressions as they happen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Decrease diversity as disparity</strong></td>
<td>• Create equal treatment policies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(differences in status between members)</td>
<td>• Invite underrepresented group members to leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Create collaborative leadership models</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Exercise: SMARTIE Goals

Think about the 3 diversity constructs:

• In your environment, where are the priorities?
• Create a SMARTIE goal that will help move the needle and promote inclusivity and equity in your department.
• Add your SMARTIE goal to your skills assessment

*Spend 5 minutes working on this individually, and then be prepared to share 1 idea with the larger group*
Personal Commitments
Thank you!

http://tiny.ucsf.edu/InclusiveLead
Resources

UCOP Handbook

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=49APcds4wAo Seattle Children’s talk

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MICROAGGRESSION EXAMPLE AND THEME</th>
<th>THIRD PARTY INTERVENTION EXAMPLE</th>
<th>COMMUNICATION APPROACH</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Color Blindness</strong></td>
<td>“So you don’t see color. Tell me more about your perspective. I’d also like to invite others to weigh in.”</td>
<td><strong>RE-DIRECT</strong> Shift the focus to a different person or topic. (Particularly helpful when someone is asked to speak for his/her entire race, cultural group, etc.) <strong>KEY PHRASES:</strong> “Let’s shift the conversation…” “Let’s open up this question to others….”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“When I look at you, I don’t see color.”</td>
<td>“So you believe that _____ will get tenure just because of his race. Let’s open this up to see what others think.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Myth of Meritocracy</strong></td>
<td>“How might we examine our implicit bias to ensure that gender plays no part in this and we have a fair process? What do we need to be aware of?”</td>
<td><strong>USE STRATEGIC QUESTIONS</strong> It is the skill of asking questions that will make a difference. A strategic question creates motion and options, avoids “why” and “yes or no” answers, is empowering to the receiver, and allows for difficult questions to be considered. Because of these qualities, a strategic question can lead to transformation. Useful in problem-solving, difficult situations, and change efforts. <strong>KEY PHRASES:</strong> “What would allow you…” “What could you do differently…” “What would happen if you considered the impact on…”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Of course he’ll get tenure, even though he hasn’t published much—he’s Black!”</td>
<td>“How does what you just said honor our colleague?”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Myth of Meritocracy</strong></td>
<td>“What impact do you think this has on the class dynamics? What would you need to approach this situation differently next time?”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In a committee meeting: “Gender plays no part in who we hire.”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Second-Class Citizen</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In class, an instructor tends to call on male students more frequently than female ones.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MICROAGGRESSION EXAMPLE AND THEME</td>
<td>THIRD PARTY INTERVENTION EXAMPLE</td>
<td>COMMUNICATION APPROACH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Second-Class Citizen**  
Saying “You people….” | “I was so upset by that remark that I shut down and couldn’t hear anything else.”  
“When I hear that remark, I’m offended too, because I feel that it marginalizes an entire group of people that I work with.” | **USE IMPACT AND “I” STATEMENTS**  
A clear, nonthreatening way to directly address these issues is to focus on oneself rather than on the person. It communicates the impact of a situation while avoiding blaming or accusing the other and reduces defensiveness.  
**KEY PHRASES:**  
“I felt_____ (feelings) when you said or did _______ (comment or behavior), and it _______ (describe the impact on you).” |
| **Use of Heterosexist Language**  
Saying “That’s so gay.” | | |
| **Second-Class Citizen**  
A woman who is talked over.  
Making a racist, sexist or homophobic joke. | She responds: “I would like to participate, but I need you to let me finish my thought.”  
“I didn’t think this was funny. I would like you to stop.” | **USE PREFERENCE STATEMENTS**  
Clearly communicating one’s preferences rather than stating them as demands or having others guess what is needed.  
**KEY PHRASES:**  
“What I’d like is…”  
“It would be helpful to me if….” |