UCSF Educational Skills Workshop
Fundamental Skills in the Art of Effective Feedback

Faculty Team:
Angel Kuo Angel.Kuo@ucsf.edu
Elizabeth Gatewood Elizabeth.Gatewood@ucsf.edu
Department of Family Health Care Nursing
Calvin Chou
Ryan Laponis
Department of Medicine
May 2022

Please see:
http://tiny.ucsf.edu/FeedbackFundamentals
for handouts, skills assessment link and workshops evaluation link
Today's Google Slide link:
https://tinyurl.com/UCSFfeedback051722

Creative Commons License

Attribution-NonCommercial-Share Alike 3.0 Unported

You are free:
• to Share — to copy, distribute and transmit the work
• to Remix — to adapt the work

Under the following conditions:
• Attribution. You must give the original authors credit (but not in any way
  that suggests that they endorse you or your use of the work).
• Noncommercial. You may not use this work for commercial purposes.
• Share Alike. If you alter, transform, or build upon this work, you may
distribute the resulting work only under a license identical to this one.

See http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/ for full license.
Overview of the session

- Introductions/Overview
- Interactive discussions: definitions, goals, brief literature review
- Large group didactic with 3 small group breakouts for skills application
- Final conclusion for feedback

Dashboard [http://tiny.ucsf.edu/FeedbackFundamentals](http://tiny.ucsf.edu/FeedbackFundamentals)
Today's share document [https://tinyurl.com/UCSFfeedback051722](https://tinyurl.com/UCSFfeedback051722)

Suggestions for Engagement

**Relational**
- Speak for yourself
- Practice confidentiality
- Share kind, specific feedback

**Technology**
- “Rename” yourself per your preferences
- Use “Gallery View” to see entire group
- Mute unless speaking (or intending to speak)
- Stop video (if stepping away or moving about)
- Hide non-video participant during some activities
Introductions

We will make time for more personal introductions when we go into smaller groups.

In the shared google slide - Slide #1 or #2, please put in what you’d like to get out of today’s session

Now, please share on slide #3 or #4 the first word that comes to mind when you hear ‘feedback’?

https://tinyurl.com/UCSFfeedback051722

Why Feedback?

“Without feedback, mistakes go uncorrected, good performance is not reinforced, and clinical competence is achieved incidentally or not at all.”

Ende, JAMA 1983
Definition and Facts

- **Feedback**: specific, nonjudgmental information comparing a trainee’s performance with a standard, given with intent to improve performance
- **Fact**: Feedback is always being given, consciously or unconsciously, skillfully or carelessly
- **Suggestion**: Feedback is an expression of commitment to the relationship


---

Brief Literature Review

- Feedback as part of an “educational alliance”
- Students like praise as an ‘ego boost’ but also want specific guidance when they make mistakes
- Tying feedback to **learner’s goals**
- Understanding the **learner’s position** helps
  - Consider diverse learning styles, backgrounds, etc
- Calibrating the amount of feedback

Feedback Steps

1. Set up
2. Gather Information / Observe
3. ARTful Feedback Conversations

Imagine a scenario

- Think about a learner
- Envision a scenario in which you would have a feedback conversation with that learner
- Write down answers to the following:
  - Setting, level of learner
  - What was the primary issue?
  - What did you observe the learner do or say?
  - What was the learner’s level of awareness?
  - What is the main key point(s) you want to share with the learner?
Step 1: Set-up

- Creating a permissive environment for maximal learning
  - In context of learner-teacher relationship
  - Consider power dynamics
  - Emphasize commitment to diversity, equity, inclusion and belonging
    - “People, including myself, may say things that are biased, discriminatory, hurtful or offensive. I would like you to tell me if you hear something that has a negative impact. I am here to debrief whenever needed.”
  - In the spirit of dialogue rather than downloading

- Features:
  - Temporally close to event
  - In accordance with learner’s goals:
    - What are you working on? What do you aspire to accomplish?
  - In accordance with learner’s readiness

Set-Up Microskills

1. Introduce each other, establishing a personal connection (affirmation, icebreaker, etc)
2. Express importance of feedback in learner-teacher relationship and how feedback conversations will occur (frequency, one-way vs dialogic, etc)
3. Elicit and help specify the learner’s goals for performance
4. Name a specific time for feedback proximal to the event
   (Tech: Stop video during demo; option to hide non-video participants)
   Demo: write down your observations of the microskills that the preceptor exhibited
Small Group Activity (10 min)

- Access [https://tinyurl.com/UCSFfeedback051722](https://tinyurl.com/UCSFfeedback051722) for instructions
- You will receive a 1 min (60 sec) notice before being brought back to main room; click help if needed during breakout

1. **Brief introductions**: Name, where you work, and your learners

2. One member volunteers their case and each member adopts a role as:
   - Faculty
   - Learner
   - Observer/Coach (turn off camera and use observation form on google slides)

3. Practice **Set up** (4 microskills) ONLY; may have time for 2 people to practice as faculty role

---

Step 2: Gather information

- Transcribe what is happening
  - Verbal
  - Nonverbal
- Record words and/or behaviors to give feedback about
  - Avoid “You were…”
  - Practice “I saw…”; “I heard…”; “I noticed…”
Feedback Steps

1. Set up
2. Gather Information / Observe
3. ARTful Feedback Conversations
   ✓ Reinforcing
   ✓ Modifying
   ✓ Take Homes

Laponis, in *Communication Rx*, 2017

---

**ARTful Skills**

- **Ask**
  - Self-assessment
  - Recall previously-stated goals from Set-Up
- **Respond**
  - Depends on active listening
  - Using empathic words can be helpful
- **Teach**
  - Your own assessment and thoughts
  - Behavioral and specific
  - Can illuminate blind spots
ARTful Reinforcing Feedback

1. **Ask**: What do you think you **did effectively**? (and should **keep** doing)

2. **Respond**: gently redirect learner from self-criticism, and take the opportunity to agree or reflect the learner’s self-assessment

3. **Teach**: your own assessment (if anything to add)
   - The ART cycle continues: ask for reactions to your feedback
   - **Demo** – watch for ARTful skills

Small Group Activity (10 min)

- You will receive a 1 min (60 sec) notice before being brought back to main room; click help if needed during breakout

1. One member volunteers their case and each member adopts a role as:
   - Faculty
   - Learner
   - Observer/Coach (turn off camera and use observation form)

2. Practice **ARTful Reinforcing** feedback ONLY
ARTful Modifying Feedback

1. **Ask:** What do you think you’d like to **do differently**? (stop doing)
2. **Respond**
3. **Teach** (remain nonjudgmental)
   - Continue the ART cycle: ask for reactions to your feedback

For challenging situations, try:
- Asking about **intention** (open to differences and cultural sensitivity)
- Responding with empathy or a summary
- Teaching your perception of how intention and impact differ

**Demo:** Watch for ARTful skills
Diversity Equity Inclusion and Belonging (DEI/B)

- Mindful of microaggressions and implicit bias
- Actively combat stereotypes – affirmations through eliciting learner strengths can mitigate impact of microaggressions and stereotype threat
- Ask questions to clarify intent and reflect upon impact
- INQUIRE: “What is it that concerns you the most?” “Say more about that.”
- REFRAME/RE-DIRECT: “Could there be another way to look at this…”
- PARAPHRASING/RESTATING FOR REFLECTION: “Let me summarize what I’m hearing…”
- IMPACT STATEMENTS: “I felt when you said/did___, and it___” “I noticed the patient became tearful when you said…”
- PREFERENCE STATEMENTS: “I’d like to focus on…”

Adapted from UCSF CFE Workshop: Microaggressions in the Teaching and Learning Environment

Small Group Activity (15 min)

- You will receive a 1 min (60 sec) warning before being brought back to main room; click help if needed during breakout
  1. One member volunteers their case and each member adopts a role as:
     - Faculty
     - Learner
     - Observer/Coach (turn off camera and use observation form)
  2. Practice ARTful Modifying feedback ONLY
**ARTful Take Homes for the Learner**

- **Ask learner:** “What will you take home from our conversation?”
- **Doing this teach-back allows you to**
  - Assess impact
  - Measure outcomes
  - Ensure accountability

For learners in high-stakes situations:

- **Agree on action plan and accountability**
  - By when?
  - What would you expect to happen if you can’t / don’t meet our agreement?

---

**Recap: Feedback Steps**

1. Set up
2. Gather Information / Observe
3. **ARTful Feedback Conversations**
   - Reinforcing
   - Modifying
   - Take Homes

---

Laponis, in *Communication Rx*, 2017
Final Thoughts About Feedback

"Courage is what it takes to stand up and speak
Courage is also what it takes to sit down and listen"

Evaluation and Action Plan

Link to workshop dashboard:
http://tiny.ucsf.edu/FeedbackFundamentals

1. You can copy the info from the Google Slide onto the “Skills Assessment Form” on the Dashboard to receive credit

2. Complete the Evaluation Form regarding today’s session (We love feedback! What should we keep-stop-start?)

3. Your own reflection: What is your take-away from today’s workshop?